

IEEE 802.3 YANG Data Model(s) Study Group Comments on PAR&CSD

Yan Zhuang

YANG Data Model(s) Study Group Chair

Huawei Technologies

San Diego, U.S.

July 27th, 2016

Comments on YANG Data Model(s) PAR&CSD-1

Response to Comment on PAR&CSD: Dan Romascanu

- This looks good and I am a supporter.
- Did you consider language that allows supporting the new versions of NETCONF and YANG as and if they become available in time for the development of the project? I am especially thinking to <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-ietf-netmod-rfc6020bis/> which is pretty close to approval.
- Same question for RESTCONF <https://datatracker.ietf.org/doc/draft-ietf-netconf-restconf/> which is now in IETF LC, which means that it will be available in a few months, early enough for the future IEEE 802.3 project to rely on it.

Response:

- Please see response to comment number 2 from 802.1, as shown below. This allows us to adopt future YANG versions.

We acknowledge your concern and we have addressed the issue with the following change as marked in red to the first sentence of section 5.5:Need for the project as shown below. “YANG (IETF RFC 6020 **or subsequent revision**) is a formalized data modeling language...”.

This enables the task force in conjunction with other 802 groups to determine the correct version during the draft development.

- We only reference NETCONF as an example protocol, without specifying a version (see below), other protocols such as RESTCONF are within scope.

“**using protocols such as NETCONF (NETwork CONFiguration, IETF RFC 6241)**”

Comments on YANG Data Model(s) PAR&CSD-2

Response to Comment 1 on PAR&CSD: from 802.11

- 5.5 – Expand NETCONF acronym for the first time use.

Response:

- We have changed the text to “...NETCONF (**NETwork CONFiguration**, IETF RFC 6241)...”

Response to Comment 2 on PAR&CSD: from 802.11

- CSD – update page 1 “Ad Hoc Draft Edit Copy” should this be removed?

Response:

- Thank you and we have made the change.

Comments on YANG Data Model(s) PAR&CSD-3

Response to Comment 1 on PAR&CSD: from 802.1

1. Project SCOPE is very broad

“This standard defines YANG data models for IEEE Std 802.3 Ethernet”

– Comment: Consider refining/limiting the scope to take into account the available YANG knowledge found within IEEE 802.3 and provide a more defined project timeline completion

Response:

- We are developing a new standard. All of IEEE 802.3 is within scope. We anticipate the Task Force, when formed, will assess the Clauses of 802.3 to be modeled in the standard.

From: admin-mholness-802-3-YANG-PAR-CSD-comments-0716-v02.pdf

Comments on YANG Data Model(s) PAR&CSD-4

Response to Comment 2 on PAR&CSD: from 802.1

2. Comment: Perhaps the PROJECT NEED statement should make reference to 6020bis instead of 6020
- The IETF is close to approve YANG 1.1 (rfc6020bis) and announced that further YANG modules in the IETF will use 1.1
 - Taking into account the timeline of this project and the fact that this is the first YANG project in IEEE 802.3, perhaps the development of the YANG modules starting with this project is done in YANG 1.1

Response:

- We acknowledge your concern and we have addressed the issue with the following change as marked in red to the first sentence of section 5.5:Need for the project as shown below.
“YANG (IETF RFC 6020 **or subsequent revision**) is a formalized data modeling language...”
This enables the task force, in conjunction with other 802 working groups, to determine the correct version to be used during draft development.

From: admin-mholness-802-3-YANG-PAR-CSD-comments-0716-v02.pdf

Comments on YANG Data Model(s) PAR&CSD-5

Response to Comment 3 on PAR&CSD: from 802.1

3. Project STANDARDS DEPENDENCY statement is current no
“... Is the completion of this standard dependent upon the completion of another standard: No ...”
– Comment: Change to Yes if the Project will be making reference to 6020bis (i.e., YANG 1.1) instead of 6020 (YANG 1.0)

Response:

- Please see response to comment 2. We now say “YANG (IETF RFC 6020 **or subsequent revision**) is a formalized data modeling language...”, so we are not dependent on completion of another standard.

From: admin-mholness-802-3-YANG-PAR-CSD-comments-0716-v02.pdf

Proposed changes to the PAR

- Change text in section 5.5 to Need for the project:

YANG (IETF RFC 6020 **or subsequent revision**) is a formalized data modeling language that can be used by **~~NETCONF~~ protocols such as NETCONF (NETwork CONFiguration**, IETF RFC 6241), a widely accepted network configuration protocol. Other standards development organizations, **(e.g., Internet Engineering Task Force (IETF) and the Metro Ethernet Forum (MEF))**, have adopted YANG, and are developing a broad range of YANG data models. Development of standardized YANG models for IEEE Std 802.3 Ethernet will help to reduce the operational cost of managing Ethernet networks.

Proposed changes to the CSD responses

- Changes responding to comments are in “YANG_SG_csd_v1.6.pdf” for:
 - Managed Objects
 - Technical Feasibility
 - Economic Feasibility

Thank You!